



### **In Order to Flourish: Musical Pathways, Opportunities to Build and Questions to Ask**

The following document sketches out the processes that support – and challenge – young musicians seeking to enter the field of classical music, from early childhood through young adult professional lives. It starts with the pre-school years because youth orchestras or conservatory training programs are far too late to address two key issues: 1) the diversity of young musicians who are able to travel this pathway or 2) the breadth of skills that young classical musicians acquire. Both of these processes have to begin much earlier, provoke serious re-examinations of musical pedagogy and program design, and involve many more stakeholders.

This work is the result of a number of converging events and efforts: a national study of El-Sistema-inspired orchestras in the U.S. and a Mellon Foundation meeting in December 2015 that addressed the issue of diversity in American orchestras, at which time Dennie Palmer Wolf of WolfBrown and Dalouge Smith of the San Diego Youth Symphony volunteered to create a developmental map of the trajectories of young musicians in the field of classical music. The following map draws on multiple sources:

- A Barr Foundation and Klarman Family Foundation study of pathways to musical excellence in metropolitan Boston
- A 3-year planning process for the Civic Orchestra, the training orchestra of the Chicago Symphony
- A series of Mellon Foundation-funded meetings addressing the question of diversity in American orchestras, convened in partnership with the League of American orchestras
- A national study of ten El-Sistema-inspired youth orchestras in the U.S. by WolfBrown and Longy School of Music of Bard College
- Discussions with teaching artists providing instrumental training in under-resourced communities (e.g., San Diego Youth Symphony and Conservatory, Community Musicworks, The People’s Music School, and Palaver, a Boston-area consortium of young musicians many of whom teach in urban classical music education programs)
- A survey of young people participating in Carnegie Hall’s NYO2 (National Youth Orchestra) summer training program at Purchase, NY
- Conversations with grantee organizations in Carnegie Hall’s Play USA program (seven communities developing pathways for supporting serious young musicians).

The examples we have included are by no means exhaustive. We need more; the work is ongoing. All suggestions and additions welcome.

- Dennie Palmer Wolf: [dennie@wolfbrown.com](mailto:dennie@wolfbrown.com)
- Dalouge Smith: [dsmith@sdys.org](mailto:dsmith@sdys.org)

| <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Birth<br/>to<br/>Five</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><i>Music as a<br/>source of<br/>joy and<br/>human<br/>connection</i></p> | <b>What’s needed to flourish as young musicians?</b>  | <b>Challenges for under-resourced youth and families</b>  | <b>Creating a supportive ecology</b>  | <b>Questions we should be asking/<br/>Some examples to consider</b>  |
|---|---|---|---|--|
|   | <p>Live music learning with multiple approaches such as singing, body percussion, and playing simple instruments</p> <p>Music as a source for developing socio-emotional skills like collaboration, turn taking, and self-regulation, as well as emotional expression</p> <p>Learning music with many modes, tempi, structures, traditions, instruments, and languages of many cultures to develop keen listening and perception skills</p> | <p>Low-and even moderate cost childcare options rarely have well-developed music programs</p> <p>Young children are typically in the role of consumers rather than creators with few opportunities for young people to improvise or compose</p> <p>Teachers may not have even elementary music training; child care centers lack real musical instruments</p> <p>The temptation to depend on recorded, rather than live music, or to use music as background rather than central activity</p> | <p>Extend artist-in-residence work to reach many more childcare and pre-K settings</p> <p>Identify and share the many reasons why live music should be an integral part of early childhood education curricula (e.g., one strategy for closing the “word gap”)<sup>1</sup></p> <p>Ensure that the certification and professional development training for early childhood teachers and aides includes music</p> | <p>How does music-making become a resource that hospitals, clinics, and home visitors offer young families as part of building close ties, supporting play, and developing communication skills? (<i>Carnegie Hall’s Lullaby Project for young families in NYC</i>)</p> <p>How do we build music into the growing numbers of early childhood programs? (<i>Settlement Music School’s Kaleidoscope program</i><sup>2</sup>)</p> <p>How does music become a part of the curriculum for professional training for child-care and pre-K teachers? (<i>Wolf Trap Early Learning through the Arts</i><sup>3</sup>)</p> <p>How does music become an integral strategy and partner in national and local efforts to improve maternal and infant health? (<i>Too Small to Fail &amp; National Black Child Development Institute’s playlist</i>)</p> |

<sup>1</sup> Carnegie Hall. Why Making Music Matters, <https://www.carnegiehall.org/BlogPost.aspx?id=4295019679>

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.wcupa.edu/pr/1.4elliebrown.asp>

<sup>3</sup> [www.wolftrap.com](http://www.wolftrap.com)

|  | <b>What's needed to flourish as young musicians?</b>   | <b>Challenges for under-resourced youth and families</b>   | <b>Creating a supportive ecology</b>  | <b>Questions we should be asking/<br/>Some examples to consider</b>  |
|--|--|--|---|--|
| <p><b>Elementary Years (K – 8)</b><br/><b>In-school programs</b></p> <p><i>Early engagement and the opportunity to build strong skills</i></p> | <p>Early (pre-K – 2) experience on simple instruments (percussion, Orff, recorder)</p>   | <p>“Academization” of early grades, with little time for arts or play, esp. in low-performing schools, with consequent loss of time for music, which is classified as a non-academic, thus elective, subject</p> | <p>Music teachers who understand the challenges children and families encounter, working to make music participation possible</p>                                       | <p>How do we ensure that gifted and talented programs use music as part of identifying students?</p>   |
|  | <p>Opportunity to choose a “real” instrument for ensemble playing before the customary 4<sup>th</sup>/5<sup>th</sup> grade band/orchestra</p>                  | <p>Competition for elective funds, space, resources with other electives like STEM, technology, etc.</p>   | <p>Expand the curriculum in programs that train future music educators, re-emphasizing their own artistry and musical excellence as a source for effective teaching</p> | <p>How do youth orchestras, symphonies partner with their school districts to build back sequential music programs in public schools? (OPUS Project at San Diego Youth Symphony)</p>   |
|  | <p>Regular, sustained quality instruction in large and small ensembles, with occasional one-on-one attention to build basic habits</p>                         | <p>Itinerant music teachers spread across many schools with huge student loads</p>   | <p>Expand music curriculum to include improvisation, composition, ear training, etc.</p>  | <p>How do we build cohorts of youth who can “stick together” as young musicians, supporting one another’s hard work, allowing them to form an identity as a musician? (Orchkids at BSO supports very early ensembles with primary school-aged players)</p>                           |
|  | <p>Peers who are beginning to play music seriously</p>   | <p>Narrow general music curriculum with singing + accompaniment of narrow range of pieces drawing on Western commercial music</p>  | <p>Build sequential music programs, occurring regularly (daily, weekly) that include singing, simple instruments, and composition</p>                                   | <p>How do we ensure that young musicians who may need academic support are not excluded from electives like music classes, band, or orchestra? (OPUS Project at San Diego Youth Symphony is piloting music interventions with ELL, low-performing, behavior-challenged students)</p> |
|  | <p>Learning how to practice productively</p>   | <p>Lack of expertise and capacity at schools and in districts: shortage of quality certified music teachers, principals without music oversight experience</p>   | <p>Challenge notion that ensembles should wait until 4<sup>th</sup> or 5<sup>th</sup> grade esp. for instruments like wind and brass</p>                                | <p>What are the kinds of research and evaluation partnerships that will develop compelling evidence of consequences of early music training? (Harmony Project &amp; Northwestern University; El Sistema, WolfBrown &amp; Longy)</p>  |
|  | <p>Curriculum that includes improvisation and composition as ways to build musicianship</p>  | <p>Charter schools that increasingly serve students and families in under-resourced communities do not support sequential arts education of the kind that would support serious young musicians</p>              | <p>Raise money for stipends for older student mentors to act as role models</p>   |  |
|  | <p>Decent instruments, producing quality sound</p>   |  | <p>Help young musicians make the transition to middle school even as other electives multiply and playing music becomes “nerdy”</p>                                     |  |
|  | <p>Varied high quality musical repertoire from range of traditions, within the mastery of young players so that they can experience making musical choices</p> |  |   |  |
| <p>Performance opportunities</p>   |  |  |   |  |

|  | <b>What's needed to flourish as young musicians?</b>   | <b>Challenges for under-resourced youth and families</b>   | <b>Creating a supportive ecology</b>  | <b>Questions we should be asking/<br/>Some examples to consider</b>  |
|--|--|--|---|--|
| <p><b>Elementary Years (K-8)</b></p> <p><b>After- or Out-of-School Musical Study</b></p> <p><b>Early development of a musical identity</b></p> | <p>Opportunities for one-on-one or small ensemble learning to complement large, school-based ensembles in order to build strong basic technique</p>  | <p>Few contacts who can help families find after- or out-of-school music learning that is good and affordable</p>  | <p>In-school music teachers who know the opportunities in their community and connect families to these</p>   | <p>How do community schools of the arts establish satellite programs spread throughout neighborhoods? (<i>The Peoples Music School, Settlement Music School</i>)</p>   |
|  | <p>Learning the habits and strategies for practicing outside of classes and lessons</p>  | <p>The demands of travel to music programs occurring off school site, outside of school day, esp. when families have multiple children</p>   | <p>Congregations that support choirs and youth instrumental performance as a part of services</p>   | <p>How do symphony orchestras become a force supporting music education? (<i>LA Phil's El Sistema-inspired programs, Kalamazoo Symphony's collective bargaining agreement that allows players to earn additional salary for teaching in their "Kids in Tune"</i>)</p>  |
|  | <p>A wider community of peers who also play music seriously and/or who respect playing music as an accomplishment</p>                                | <p>Families may have few funds for additional classes, lessons, or instruments; demands hard choices about time and resources</p>  | <p>After- or out-of-school programs located in or travelling to neighborhoods that need them the most</p>   | <p>How do older, more advanced students learn to teach and practice with younger students? (<i>Play On, Philly's Ambassador's Program, Daily Orchestra at Community Music Works; Kids in Tune, Kalamazoo Symphony's middle school orchestra program deliberately meets at site for their elementary program</i>)</p> |
|  | <p>Family or other trusted adults who recognize, respect, and encourage musical activity, even when it demands travel, arrangements, and savings</p> | <p>Family members' may not have had the time/resources to develop their own musical skills, making it hard to judge programs and teachers or engage in practicing</p> <p>Finding the time and energy to develop knowledge and advocacy skills on behalf of children's musical interests and talents in the community (e.g., finding programs, seeking scholarships and sponsors, carpooling with other families, etc.)</p> | <p>After-school programs that will offer continuous music study (in addition to shorter, more exposure programs) and pay well enough to attract and retain skilled teachers</p> <p>Music programs that include locations and mentors for daily practicing</p> <p>Specialized training for teaching artists who work in these settings (how to establish studio atmosphere, keep students engaged, etc.)</p> |  |

|  | What's needed to flourish as young musicians?   | Challenges for under-resourced youth and families  | Creating a supportive ecology   | Questions we should be asking/<br>Some examples to consider  |
|--|---|--|---|--|
| <p><b>Entry-level youth orchestra/ Upper elementary band or orchestra</b></p> <p><b>Developing proficiency</b></p> | <p>Learning the routines for being a musician (coming to lessons, practicing, listening, going to live performances in community)</p> <p>Next level of curriculum that includes wide range of musical skills (composition, improvisation, but also theory, music history, sight reading, and ear training)</p> <p>Sequential expectations and progression to stay motivated</p> <p>Large ensemble playing complemented by small ensemble instruction (especially chamber music), some one-on-one attention to developing technique, if not individual lessons</p> <p>Affordable, quality instruments<sup>4</sup></p> <p>Regular performances/recitals</p> <p>Experience with multiple teachers for advanced players</p> <p>Growth mindset necessary to take on increasingly difficult pieces, auditions, along with ups and downs of winning and losing</p> | <p>Learning how to judge quality of teachers and programs, esp. if family is not musical</p> <p>Gaining knowledge of/access to music programs that occur outside of school day or at other sites</p> <p>Creating routines and spaces for practice, finding occasions to play</p> <p>Supporting music learning for one or more children (car to drive, costs involved, juggling demands with other children, etc.)</p> <p>Funds for lessons, fees, and instrument rental, cost of participating in trips or off-site performances</p> <p>Increasing likelihood that young players from under-resourced communities, especially communities of color, will be in the minority in upper-level, competitive programs</p> | <p>Creating spaces/organizations that support daily practice with peers and older students, supervised by teachers</p> <p>School music teachers who can and will partner with families in locating added opportunities</p> <p>Forging connections to other organizations (e. g., congregations, all-city, all-state) that support youth musical activity and provide opportunities to perform</p> <p>Shared spaces so that programs can occur where youth and families have easy access</p> <p>Public school music programs that provide equitable access and instruction</p> <p>Supporting youth to learn how to audition, bounce back if not selected</p> | <p>How does the music field learn lessons from other specialized programs (chess, debate, Odyssey of the Mind, sports leagues) around what keeps youth persisting past the initial stages – when the going gets tough?</p> <p>How do arts high schools establish feeder programs that help students and families learn about arts education, including preparing for applying? (<b>TWIGS program in Baltimore</b>)</p> <p>How do community music schools establish campuses in multiple neighborhoods? (<b>People's Music School in Chicago</b>)</p> <p>How do we build community-wide consortia for music-learning pathways linking in- and out-of-school music learning? (<b>Philadelphia Music Alliance for Youth/San Diego Youth Symphony's OPUS Project</b>)</p> <p><b>Classics for Kids Foundation supplies free high-quality string instruments to youth ensembles and orchestras</b><sup>4</sup></p> |

4. Classics for Kids Foundation. (<http://classicsforkids.org/>).

| <p><b>Secondary School (9 - 12) In- School Music Programs</b></p> <p><i>Cultivating musicianship</i></p> | <p><b>What’s needed to flourish as young musicians?</b></p>  | <p><b>Challenges for under-resourced youth and families</b></p>  | <p><b>Creating a supportive ecology</b></p>  | <p><b>Questions we should be asking/ Some examples to consider</b></p>  |
|--|--|--|--|---|
|  | <p>Daily ensemble class for credit</p> <p>Sequential honor ensembles</p> <p>Quality instruments in good repair</p> <p>Dedicated performance and practice rooms</p> <p>Regular performance and festival opportunities</p> <p>Instrument and section coaching by teaching artists</p> <p>Peers who play music seriously, and/or respect the work and accomplishment involved</p> <p>Supportive district and site administrative campus culture</p> | <p>Families faced with schools without or with low-quality music programs have to hunt for, transfer to, or apply to different schools which may involve travel, new or unfamiliar neighborhoods</p> <p>Negotiating class schedules, conflicts, or forced double ELA and Math periods for English Language Learners or other students who may have special needs</p> <p>No instruments or old unrepaired instruments</p> <p>No funds for supplies, coaches, festivals, uniforms, or transport</p> <p>Families with little musical background who do not know how to support their music student or the program</p> <p>No one at the school or district who knows how to/has the time to advocate for a talented young musician</p> | <p>School counselors and advisors who will advocate for students enrolling in sequential music classes</p> <p>Specialized high schools (arts and others) that schedule academic classes 8 – 12, leaving 1 – 5 free for intensive specialization</p> <p>Communication between elementary and secondary music programs to encourage students to stay enrolled</p> <p>Support for music teachers from campus and district leaders, campus teachers, feeder school music teachers, and community partners</p> <p>Professional guest teaching artist instructors</p> <p>Opportunities to attend professional performances</p> <p>Booster organization/community support for coaches, festivals, uniforms, and transport</p> <p>Pathways for honor ensemble and advanced community program participation</p> | <p>How can the wider field help schools to support and sustain orchestra, as well as band, programs at the high school level? (<i>Partnership between Play On, Philly! and area high schools</i>)</p> <p>How does the field support the continuing professional development for in-school music teachers? (<i>Music Educators Workshop</i>)</p> |



| Upper Level Youth Orchestras (High School)<br><br><i>Becoming a public performer</i> | What's needed to flourish as young musicians?  | Challenges for under-resourced youth and families  | Creating a supportive ecology  | Questions we should be asking/<br>Some examples to consider   |
|--|--|--|--|---|
|  | <p>Individual/small group instruction with skilled instrumental teacher (s); multiple teachers providing different perspectives and emphases</p> <p>Motivating tiers of orchestra and chamber music experiences (all city, all state, UIL) that provide full scholarships: tuition, travel, instruments, master classes, etc.</p> <p>Curriculum that includes wide range of musical skills (theory, composition, improvisation, music history)</p> <p>Quality instrument</p> <p>Access to private small group and esp. individualized instruction</p> <p>Access to conservatory prep programs</p> <p>Access to ensembles/more advanced peers that can challenge student to play better</p> | <p>Music pedagogy “stuck” in “I’ll teach you what my teacher taught me”; little serious re-examination of musical learning in light of cognitive science, new understandings of motivation and achievement</p> <p>Opportunities to travel and tour</p> <p>Demands of being “the scholarship student,” “the black oboist”, etc.</p> <p>Lack of peers with similar experiences, ethnic and/or cultural isolation</p> <p>Other responsibilities: family needs for childcare, elder care, added income</p> | <p>Strategies for program recruiting that yield diverse enrollment</p> <p>Paying orchestra-related jobs for youth (e.g., as mentors for younger students, as music librarians, ushers)</p> <p>Strategies for securing private lessons or very small ensembles</p> <p>Links to congregations with strong music programs that can identify and develop young musicians</p> <p>Creation of very high caliber orchestras that feature diverse membership (<i>Take a Stand, Carnegie Hall’s NYO and NYO2</i>)</p> | <p>What could U.S. programs learn from their colleagues abroad?</p> <p>How does the classical music field learn from other arts fields about keeping young people involved? (<i>See Whitney Museum report on youth programs in museums: Room to Rise<sup>5</sup></i>)</p> <p>How does the classical music field learn from music programs in other roles and genres? (<i>NY Philharmonics’ Very Young Composers, youth choruses, Berklee’s City Music</i>)</p> <p>Who will invest in longitudinal studies of young people seeking to travel the pathway from youth orchestra level to professional performer in order to better understand what constitutes an opportunity, what obstacles arise?</p> |

<sup>5</sup> <http://whitney.org/Education/Teens/RoomToRise>

| National/<br>Regional<br>Programs for<br>Skilled Young<br>Musicians at<br>High School<br><br><i>Pre-<br/>conservatory<br/>performance</i> | What's needed to flourish as young musicians?   | Challenges for under-resourced youth and families  | Creating a supportive ecology  | Questions we should be asking/<br>Some examples to consider  |
|---|---|--|--|--|
|   | <p>See earlier points on upper level youth orchestra above, plus:</p> <p>Competitive level instrumental skills</p> <p>Access to studio-quality recording resources</p> <p>Clear role models and mentors, including access to master classes or lessons with multiple teachers who provide a variety of approaches</p> | <p>See notes on upper level youth orchestras above, plus:</p> <p>Social and artistic network for learning how to audition, complete and submit applications, and how to bounce back when not selected</p> <p>Little knowledge about or resources for programs outside of public school or immediate community</p> <p>Access to high quality instrument</p> <p>Regular and feasible access to strong instrumental teacher</p> <p>If accepted into programs, young people from under-represented communities may struggle with isolation, the experience of being enrolled as “the underdog”</p> <p>Families may be reluctant for young people to travel/may need scholarship/other families to talk to and learn from</p> | <p>Build a network of music mentors throughout a community</p> <p>Summer programs that actively recruit and support diverse young musicians resulting in ensembles diverse enough to address issues of isolation for young people from under-represented communities<br/><i>(Carnegie Hall's NYO2, Take a Stand National orchestras)</i></p> <p>Conservatories that support mock auditions, provide feedback and supports for candidates</p> | <p>How does the field build its commitment to mentoring in and outside of formal programs? <i>(La Jolla Music Society/San Diego Youth Symphony “Music Institute” mentor artists)</i></p> <p>How can the classical music field learn from other arts organizations that focus on diversifying participation? <i>(Recent efforts at ABT and School of American Ballet)</i></p> <p>What can the classical music field learn from fields like STEM about recruiting and sustaining diverse participants (initiatives for young women and other underrepresented groups)?</p> <p>Could the U.S. State Department more actively support touring for youth orchestras/choruses?</p> <p>How could the Kennedy Center function as a national showcase/stage for youth orchestras and choruses, sponsoring regional auditions and a summer festival?</p> |



| <p><b>Conservatory/<br/>Collegiate-<br/>level Musical<br/>Education</b></p> <p><i>Taking on the<br/>challenge of<br/>pre-<br/>professional<br/>training</i></p> | <p><b>What’s needed to flourish as young musicians?</b></p>   | <p><b>Challenges for under-resourced youth and families</b></p>   | <p><b>Creating a supportive ecology</b></p>  | <p><b>Questions we should be asking/<br/>Some examples to consider</b></p>   |
|---|---|---|--|--|
|   | <p>Active, long-term career planning, including undergrad Internships in multiple aspects of the music field beyond performance</p> <p>Help identifying summer programs that will build skills and social networks of teachers and colleagues</p> <p>Availability of quality instrument</p> <p>Access to regular, strong private instruction</p> <p>Transition orchestras operating between conservatory and career</p> | <p>Same as first-time college students</p> <p>Tuition debt in absence of scholarship</p> <p>Work-study options that also build musical prowess</p> <p>Access to quality instrument, esp. for recitals and auditions through loan programs, “attic” instrument drives, etc.</p> <p>Knowledge of and funding for high quality summer programs (including room and board, travel)</p> <p>Unable to travel to auditions</p> | <p>“Posse” strategies for young people from under-served communities<sup>6</sup> while in training</p> <p>Access to national database about programs and scholarships</p> <p>Well-rounded musical curriculum that includes community work, entrepreneurship, recording engineering, etc. so that young musicians can earn while building musical skills (NEC, Curtis, and Cleveland Institute initiatives in this direction)</p> <p>Diverse counselors/mentors at summer programs who have traveled this same road</p> | <p>How do more conservatories think about educating a well-rounded musician who can combine performing with other careers? (Longy-Bard’s MAT program, Berklee’s dual degree programs)</p> <p>How do we think more broadly about diversifying the classical music world so that young people stay involved even if they do not become performers (composers, managers, front of house, technology design)? (Very Young Composers; New Victory Theater Usher program)</p> <p>How does the field harvest the insights across programs that have long worked on issues of diversifying classical music? (New World Symphony, Civic Orchestra, Sphinx, Sinfonetta, and others)</p> <p>How does music field learn from colleges and universities supporting first generation students? (Riverside, CA, University of Maryland’s Meyerhoff Fellows in bio-medical fields, Posse Foundation, etc.)</p> |

<sup>6</sup> <https://www.possefoundation.org/>

| <b>Active Life as a Young Musician:<br/>Full time or Part-time</b> | <b>What's needed to flourish as young musicians?</b>   | <b>Challenges for under-resourced youth and families</b>  | <b>Creating a supportive ecology</b>   | <b>Questions we should be asking/<br/>Some examples to consider</b>  |
|--|--|---|--|--|
|  | <p>Knowledge of mixed career paths in music (performing combined with teaching, studio work, music administration)</p> <p>Social capital: connections to: 1) mature musicians who will mentor younger ones coming up in the field; 2) those who hold auditions and hire</p> <p>Continuing access to learning: musicians for audition preparation, instrumental instruction, opportunities to “play in”, rehearse as part of ensemble, etc.</p> | <p>Pull of “safer” careers</p> <p>Opportunity costs</p> <p>Isolation in orchestras and other classical music ensembles, lack of role models</p> <p>Finding jobs/fellowships that pay decent salary and leave time for continuing instrumental learning</p> <p>Juggling many “gigs” to make ends meet, little time or money for continuing musical development</p> | <p>Career counseling past graduation at conservatories and schools of music</p> <p>Deliberate building of networks and internships pre-graduation; mentorships past graduation</p> <p>Making public the career trajectories of graduates of programs like Sphinx, Sinfonetta, and New World who come from under-served and under-represented communities</p> | <p>How does the field design and support more effective internships, mentor programs, and fellowships? (<a href="#">Houston Symphony community fellows program</a>; <a href="#">Orchestra League report on successes and issues in orchestra fellowships (Fall, 2016)</a> <a href="#">SNAAP<sup>7</sup> data on role of these supports</a>)</p> <p>Will the field invest in longitudinal research on how musicians have moved from programs like Sphinx, orchestra fellowships, etc. to permanent orchestra positions?</p> <p>What can the music field learn from other fellowship programs that seek to diversify competitive fields? (<a href="#">Mellon Humanities Fellows</a>, <a href="#">Meyerhoff Fellows in biomedical sciences</a>)</p> |

<sup>7</sup> Strategic National Arts Alumni Project, multi-year follow-up of arts school graduates, at [snaap.indiana.edu](http://snaap.indiana.edu).

## **For further thinking:**

The foregoing document makes clear how important Individual lessons with multiple teachers, decent instruments, and opportunities to prepare and perform all are to becoming a professional classical musician. These elements are the paving stones that lead from early private lessons to world-renown conservatories, then on to careers in the classical music field, including orchestras. However, like the paths to careers in neuroscience or museums, these routes are often gated – difficult to enter or pursue if you do not come from a musical family, live in a major metropolitan area, or have access to a private teacher who is well-connected to further opportunities. The net result is that the classical music field, in particular the orchestral world, has failed to attract, nurture, or be enriched by a diverse corps of musicians and the varied cultural and artistic perspectives they bring.<sup>8</sup> As this document also makes clear, the field is keenly aware of and hard at work on strategies designed to address the creation of early and sustained pathways for committed and talented young musicians. These include: raising the musical quality of orchestral programs for very young players, establishing feeder programs for district-supported high schools for the fine and performing arts, more inclusive programs for the prep divisions at conservatories, and youth orchestras designed to recruit and train diverse young musicians. These efforts all matter, but there are other issues the field has to confront, understand, and address:

- **A deeper understanding of inequalities in the pathway:** We need a much clearer understanding of where the pathways break down and why. This includes a close look at the human factors involved (e.g., young people’s reluctance to be the “underdog,” isolate, or “scholarship girl”; the nature of auditions; the cultural identities and beliefs of teachers and staff at music schools and conservatories). Where, for instance, is the cross-conservatory longitudinal study of who survives in the field, who drops out, and why?
- **Beyond players:** What does the field need to confront about the lack of diversity throughout the orchestral field – in esteemed teachers, managers, music directors, composers, sound engineers, critics, as well as players?
- **A reconsideration of classical music pedagogy:** What does it take to make a skilled, well-rounded instrumentalist who starts later, has less time to practice, and who may have competing home and work responsibilities? What could the learning sciences tell us about new or streamlined routes to musicality? What does the field need to understand about the role of debilitating factors like stereotype threat or performance enhancing strategies like the visualization techniques used by athletes?
- **The role of peer groups:** How do we create situations where young people thrive as accomplished classical musicians with enough peers like themselves as colleagues? What can we learn about opening up a field from diversity efforts in the field of ballet, support groups for first time college attendees, and programs supporting young women in STEM fields?
- **A better understanding of young people’s and families’ agency:** We have a great deal to learn from the young people who make this journey successfully, and from the families who support them throughout those years. Efforts to imagine solutions will be impoverished without asking them about what they already know.

---

<sup>8</sup> Doeser, James. (2016). Racial and ethnic diversity in the orchestra field. League of American Orchestras. Accessed at <http://americanorchestras.org/images/stories/diversity/Racial-Ethnic-and-Gender-Diversity-in-the-Orchestra-Field-Final-92116.pdf>. December 31, 2016; Rabkin, Nick & O’Connell, Monica (2016). Forty years of fellowships. League of American Orchestras. Accessed at <http://americanorchestras.org/images/stories/diversity/Forty-Years-of-Fellowships-A-Study-of-Orchestras-Efforts-to-Include-African-American-and-Latino-Musicians-Final-92116.pdf>, December 31, 2016.